

**MINUTES OF THE
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL COUNCIL MEETING**

December 4, 2013
MAG Office, Saguaro Room
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

# Vice Mayor Alex Finter for Mayor Scott Smith, Mesa	Mayor Jerry Weiers, Glendale
Mayor Michael LeVault, Youngtown, Vice Chair	Mayor Georgia Lord, Goodyear
Vice Mayor Robin Barker, Apache Junction	* Mayor Rebecca Jimenez, Guadalupe
# Mayor Marie Lopez Rogers, Avondale	Mayor Thomas Schoaf, Litchfield Park
Councilmember Eric Orsborn for Mayor Jackie Meck, Buckeye	Mayor Christian Price, City of Maricopa
Councilmember Mike Farrar for Mayor David Schwan, Carefree	# Supervisor Steve Chucuri, Maricopa County
Councilmember Reginald Monachino, Cave Creek	* Mayor Scott LeMarr, Paradise Valley
Mayor Jay Tibshraeny, Chandler	# Councilmember Cathy Carlat, Peoria
Mayor Lana Mook, El Mirage	Mayor Greg Stanton, Phoenix
Mayor Tom Rankin, Florence	* Supervisor Todd House, Pinal County
* President Ruben Balderas, Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation	Mayor Gail Barney, Queen Creek
Mayor Linda Kavanagh, Fountain Hills	* President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
Mayor Steven Holt, Gila Bend	Mayor W. J. "Jim" Lane, Scottsdale
* Governor Gregory Mendoza, Gila River Indian Community	Mayor Sharon Wolcott, Surprise
Mayor John Lewis, Gilbert	Mayor Mark Mitchell, Tempe
	* Mayor Adolfo Gamez, Tolleson
	* Mayor John Cook, Wickenburg
	* Victor Flores, State Transportation Board
	Joseph La Rue, State Transportation Board
	Roc Arnett, Citizens Transportation Oversight Committee

* Those members neither present nor represented by proxy.

Attended by telephone conference call.

+ Attended by videoconference

1. Call to Order

The meeting of the MAG Regional Council was called to order by Acting Chair Michael LeVault at 11:33 a.m.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Councilmember Cathy Carlat, Mayor Marie Lopez Rogers, Supervisor Steve Chucuri, and Vice Mayor Alex Finter as proxy for Mayor Scott Smith, joined the meeting via teleconference. Councilmember Mike Farrar was proxy for Mayor David Schwan and Councilmember Eric Orsborn was proxy for Mayor Jackie Meck.

Acting Chair LeVault introduced Youngtown City Councilmember Judy Johnson, who was present in the audience.

Acting Chair LeVault requested that members of the public who would like to comment fill out a blue public comment card for the Call to the Audience agenda item, or a yellow public comment card for Consent Agenda items or items on the agenda for action. Transit tickets for those who purchased a transit ticket to attend the meeting and parking validation were available from staff.

3. Call to the Audience

Acting Chair LeVault noted that the Call to the Audience provides an opportunity to members of the audience who wish to speak on items not scheduled on the agenda that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or on items on the agenda for discussion but not for action. Citizens are requested to not exceed a three minute time period for their comments. A total of 15 minutes is provided for the Call to the Audience agenda item, unless the Regional Council requests an exception to this limit. Those wishing to comment on agenda items posted for action will be provided the opportunity at the time the item is heard.

Acting Chair LeVault recognized public comment from Dr. Marvin Rochelle, who said he would be 90 years old at his next birthday. Dr. Rochelle expressed best wishes to everyone for the holidays. He stated that the Phoenix Dial-A-Ride program receives Proposition 400 funds. Dr. Rochelle stated that the program is in desperate need of additional driver hours, which were reduced a few years ago during a shortage of funding, and never replaced. He stated that demand for Dial-A-Ride has increased 70 percent. Dr. Rochelle noted that sometimes his Dial-A-Ride trips have taken three hours. Acting Chair LeVault thanked Dr. Rochelle for his comments.

Acting Chair LeVault recognized public comment from Dianne Barker, who stated that there might be alternative approaches to getting people to try multimodalism, besides saying to get out of their cars. She stated that she read the MAG minutes and informed Pat Vint and John Rusinek that the minutes reflected their comments accurately. Acting Chair LeVault thanked Ms. Barker for her comments.

4. Executive Director's Report

Dennis Smith, MAG Executive Director, reported on items of interest in the MAG region. He reported that MAG was selected to receive one of the 27 Strategic Highway Research Program (SHRP2) Grants.

Mr. Smith noted that MAG was one of only two metropolitan planning organizations in the nation to receive this grant. The project will be on behalf of the Western Regional Alliance and focus on the national significance of the Intermountain West as a key East/West and North/South trade corridor and how the Intermountain West can be globally competitive. Mr. Smith noted that the grant is for \$240,000.

Mr. Smith stated that the Federal Highway Administration and the Federal Transit Administration conducted a certification review of the MAG planning program on November 12-14, 2013. He explained that the primary purpose of a certification review is to formalize the continuing oversight and day-to-day evaluation of the planning process. Mr. Smith stated that a review is required every four years. He said that the reviewers indicated that many of the MAG programs were impressive and the federal review team noted that MAG will be recertified.

Mr. Smith stated that the Transportation Policy Committee has been examining decreases in the Highway User Revenue Fund, which supports transportation. He said that MAG, working with WestGroup Research, is preparing a transportation poll to gain an understanding of voters' priorities and willingness to pay for transportation improvements. Mr. Smith reported that an online focus group was conducted to assist in developing the poll instrument. Mr. Smith stated that further input was received at a stakeholder workshop on November 20, 2013. He said that the survey is being conducted and topline results are expected in January 2014.

Mr. Smith announced that the MAG Fiscal Services Division has been notified it received the Distinguished Budget Presentation Award from the Government Finance Officers Association for the 15th year in a row. He explained that to receive this award, MAG had to satisfy nationally recognized guidelines for effective budget presentations. Mr. Smith congratulated the MAG Fiscal Services Division.

Mr. Smith stated that the Joint Planning Advisory Council meeting will be held on December 11, 2013. He said that Vanessa Hickman from the Arizona State Land Department will be one of the presenters. Mr. Smith advised that RSVPs are being taken by MAG through Friday, December 6, 2013.

Mr. Smith stated that the ribbon cutting ceremony for the Litchfield Park Underpass project recently took place. He explained that the City of Litchfield Park persevered through many obstacles to see the project through completion. Mr. Smith acknowledged the assistance of Floyd Roehrich, ADOT Deputy Director for Policy, on this project.

Mr. Smith noted that Mayor Jay Tibshraeny was named Municipal Leader of the Year by the American City and County magazine. He stated that one of Mayor Tibshraeny's accomplishments was the increase of 35,000 jobs in the Price Corridor. Mayor Tibshraeny was applauded.

Mr. Smith stated that MAG is collecting nominations for the Age-Friendly Community Competition. He noted that applications are due on January 31, 2014 and will be evaluated by a panel of national experts.

Acting Chair LeVault thanked Mr. Smith for his report.

5. Approval of Consent Agenda

Acting Chair LeVault noted that agenda items #5A, #5B, #5C, #5D, #5E, #5F, #5G, #5H, and #5I were on the Consent Agenda.

Acting Chair LeVault asked members if they had questions or requests to hear a Consent Agenda item individually. None were noted. No public comment cards were received.

Acting Chair LeVault called for a motion to approve Consent Agenda items #5A, #5B, #5C, #5D, #5E, #5F, #5G, #5H, and #5I. Mayor Gail Barney moved approval of the Consent Agenda. Vice Mayor Robin Barker seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

5A. Approval of the October 23, 2013, Meeting Minutes

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the October 23, 2013, meeting minutes.

5B. Project Changes - Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and FY 2014 Arterial Life Cycle Program

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved amendments and administrative modifications to the Fiscal Year (FY) 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, FY 2014 Arterial Life Cycle Program, and as appropriate, to the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update. The FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) 2010 Update were approved by the MAG Regional Council on July 28, 2010, and have since been modified thirty times. The last modification was approved on October 23, 2013. Table A lists changes to the FY 2014 Arterial Life Cycle Program, including a correction to an administrative error in the calculation of the FY 2014 reimbursement for the Mesa Drive: US-60 (Superstition Freeway) to Southern Avenue project. Tables B and C list minor schedule and funding changes to the highway and transit programs. All of the projects to be amended may be categorized as exempt from conformity determinations and an administrative modification does not require a conformity determination. The project changes were recommended for approval by the MAG Transportation Review Committee on October 24, 2013, and by the MAG Management Committee on November 6, 2013. Projects added since the Management Committee meeting were tinted in yellow.

5C. FY 2014-2017 MAG Highway Safety Improvement Program Second Call for Projects

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the additional list of safety projects for FY 2014-2017 from the second call for projects. Since FY 2010, MAG has been receiving an annual suballocation of federal Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) funds from the Arizona Department of Transportation to be programmed for qualifying road safety improvements. For FY 2014-2017, the HSIP suballocation to MAG is \$1.9 million per year. On July 1, 2013, MAG issued a call for road safety improvement projects to be programmed in FY 2014-2017. Six projects proposed by member agencies were reviewed and recommended by the Transportation Safety Committee. This list of projects was approved by the Regional Council on September 25, 2013, however, not all available

HSIP funds were programmed for projects. Remaining funds in each fiscal year are: FY 2014 - \$319,591; FY 2015 - \$1,466,418; FY 2016 - \$1,209,114; FY 2017 - \$281,048. On September 24, 2013, the Transportation Safety Committee recommended a second call for projects to program the remaining HSIP funds for local agency safety improvement projects, and any remaining HSIP funds to be utilized for safety planning projects identified through the ongoing Strategic Transportation Safety Plan. The second call for projects was issued on October 2, 2013. Ten projects were reviewed and recommended for approval by the MAG Transportation Safety Committee on October 22, 2013, the MAG Transportation Review Committee on October 24, 2013, and the MAG Management Committee on November 6, 2013.

5D. Conformity Consultation

The Maricopa Association of Governments is conducting consultation on a conformity assessment for an amendment and administrative modification to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program. The amendment and administrative modification involve several projects, including proposed project changes in the Arterial Life Cycle and Highway Programs. The amendment includes projects that may be categorized as exempt from conformity determinations. The administrative modification includes minor project revisions that do not require a conformity determination.

5E. Approval of Draft July 1, 2013, Maricopa County and Municipality Resident Population Updates

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the draft July 1, 2013, Maricopa County and Municipality Resident Population Updates provided that the Maricopa County control total is within one percent of the final control total. MAG staff has prepared draft July 1, 2013, Maricopa County and Municipality Resident Population Updates. The Updates, which are used to prepare budgets and set expenditure limitations, were prepared using the 2010 Census as the base and updated with housing unit data supplied and verified by MAG member agencies. Since there may be changes to the Maricopa County control total by the Arizona Department of Administration, on October 29, 2013, the MAG Population Technical Advisory Committee (POPTAC) recommended approval of these draft Updates provided that the County control total is within one percent of the final control total. On November 6, 2013, the MAG Management Committee concurred with the POPTAC's recommendation.

5F. Proposed 2014 Revisions to the MAG Standard Specifications and Details for Public Works Construction

The MAG Standard Specifications and Details Committee has completed its review of proposed revisions to the MAG Standard Specifications and Details for Public Works Construction. These revisions have been recommended for approval by the committee and have been reviewed by MAG member agency Public Works Directors and/or Engineers. It is anticipated that the 2014 revision will be available for purchase in early January 2014. The proposed 2014 revisions to the MAG Standard Specifications and Details for Public Works Construction were provided to the MAG Management Committee.

5G. Arizona Building Officials Code Review and Development Committee Amendments for the 2012 International Code Council Codes

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, recommended that MAG member agencies consider adopting the Arizona Building Officials (AZBO) Code Review and Development Committee Amendments for the 2012 International Code Council (ICC) codes. At the October 16, 2013, MAG Building Codes Committee meeting, members discussed an initiative to reach consensus in unison on the Arizona Building Officials (AZBO) Code Review and Development Committee Amendments for the 2012 International Code Council (ICC) Codes. The MAG Building Codes Committee makes recommendations on the development, interpretation and enforcement of building codes in the MAG region. It also provides a regional forum for construction, development, and other issues as they relate to building codes. In an effort to promote uniformity throughout MAG jurisdictions under the interest of life safety, a motion was passed to recommend that MAG member agencies consider adopting the AZBO Code Review and Development Committee Amendments for the 2012 ICC Codes. On November 6, 2013, the MAG Management Committee recommended that MAG member agencies consider adopting the Arizona Building Officials (AZBO) Code Review and Development Committee Amendments for the 2012 International Code Council (ICC) codes.

5H. MAG FY 2015 PSAP Annual Element/Funding Request and FY 2015-2019 Equipment Program

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the MAG FY 2015 PSAP Annual Element/Funding Request and FY 2015-2019 Equipment Program. Each year, the MAG Public Safety Answering Point (PSAP) Managers submit inventory and upgrade requests that are used to develop a five-year equipment program that forecasts future 9-1-1 equipment needs of the region and enables MAG to provide estimates of future funding needs to the Arizona Department of Administration (ADOA). The ADOA Order of Adoption stipulates allowable funding under the Emergency Telecommunications Services Revolving Fund. The MAG FY 2015 PSAP Annual Element/Funding Request and FY 2015-2019 Equipment Program were recommended for approval on July 11, 2013, by the MAG PSAP Managers, on October 2, 2013, by the MAG 9-1-1 Oversight Team, and on November 6, 2013, by the MAG Management Committee.

5I. Appointment of the Arizona Department of Transportation Member Position to the MAG Economic Development Committee

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the appointment of John Nelson, Senior Policy Advisor, as the ADOT representative on the MAG Economic Development Committee (EDC). In August 2013, the MAG Regional Council approved the updated composition of the MAG Economic Development Committee (EDC). The composition includes eighteen MAG member agency positions that have one-year terms with possible reappointment by recommendation of the Executive Committee and approval of the MAG Regional Council. On November 21, 2013, a letter was sent by the Director of the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) requesting that John Nelson, Senior Policy Advisor, serve as the ADOT representative on the EDC. On December 3, 2013, the MAG Regional Council Executive Committee recommended approval of the appointment of Mr. Nelson.

6. Establishment of an In-Market Trade, Investment and Tourism Office in Mexico City

Mr. Smith stated that the City of Phoenix approached MAG last week regarding the establishment of an in-market trade, investment and tourism office in Mexico City. He said that Phoenix is seeking partners in this endeavor, and groups they have approached include the Phoenix Suns and the Arizona Diamondbacks. Mr. Smith noted that a partnership would consist of a one-year commitment in the amount of \$25,000. Mr. Smith stated that the Mexico City office would include a dedicated contractor on-site. He added that he has been told the office will be badged more broadly than just Phoenix and a name has not yet been decided.

Mr. Smith displayed a graph that showed that Arizona's rate of growth in trade is flat and is losing trade to Texas. He stated that continuing as status quo is not going to make anything happen. Mr. Smith stated that the government structure in Mexico is different from the United States – it is very centralized. He said that it is a transportation issue and improvements need to be made on the United States side of the border and complementary improvements need to be made on the Mexico side.

Mr. Smith stated that MAG has a project called Building an International Economic Network (BIEN), a business to business network that is being soft launched later this month. He expressed the value of small to medium businesses on both sides of the border working together.

Mr. Smith noted that Hank Marshall, from the Phoenix Economic Development Department was present at the meeting. He said that by making a commitment as a partner in the amount of \$25,000 of MAG dues, MAG could have input into the scope of work. Mr. Smith indicated that MAG is interested in the rail aspect and the BIEN aspect. He said that a partnership the Mexico City office would provide a pathway for all MAG agencies to have a voice, and opportunities with Mexican businesses.

Mr. Smith suggested that for \$25,000 MAG could do this for one year and then not have to contribute more if it was deemed not worthwhile. He remarked that unless we do something bold, we are not going to move that flat line. Mr. Smith stated that SANDAG is very active in Mexico and has conducted far greater relationship building than MAG. He stated that the Executive Committee, with one dissenting vote, recommended moving forward with this and provide input into the scope.

Mr. Smith invited Mr. Marshall to come forward and address the Regional Council on the office.

Mr. Marshall stated that there is \$1.5 billion per day in cross-border business. Dividing the United States into five vertical slices – one that is the east coast, one that is the west coast, and three in the middle – the one slice that is Arizona going north and south amounts to only \$25 million per day out of a total \$1.5 billion in trade. Mr. Marshall stated that Mayor Stanton has indicated to staff that it is imperative that the City of Phoenix embark on this effort. He noted that in the eyes of Mexico City, having a unified, collaborative footprint makes a bold statement, and he added that it is Phoenix's intent to be as inclusive as possible.

Mayor Schoaf expressed that he absolutely was supportive of expanding our contacts and presence in Mexico and he has said many times that Mexico is a tremendous opportunity for businesses in Arizona.

Mayor Schoaf stated that we do not take advantage of this nearly as much as we could. He asked if an analysis had been done to show the business going in horizontal slices.

Mr. Marshall replied that such an analysis had probably been done but he had not seen it. He said that he felt the numbers would likely be equally reflective as the vertical slices numbers. Mr. Marshall stated that Arizona is a pass-through state; approximately \$26 billion in business crosses Arizona's border each year, but only \$6 billion stays here, which means that \$20 billion goes on to other locations. He stated that the Arizona slice at \$25 billion is bookended by the West Coast slice, which totals about \$400 billion per year, and the Texas slice, which is about \$350 billion per year. Mr. Marshall indicated that horizontally, most of the business is north of Arizona, and would likely show the same levels.

Mayor Schoaf commented that he thought about 80 percent of the Mexican businesses whose products go to the United States are likely located in the northern third of Mexico, which is essentially Sonora. He stated that this is the area where goods are manufactured in huge volumes and is anticipated to grow. Mayor Schoaf asked if Phoenix had looked at where other states and cities are locating offices and their level of productivity in generating business. Mayor Schoaf stated that he did not want to downplay Mexico City, because it is a key player, but Arizona has no presence in Sonora. He asked if Phoenix was doing anything to provide a presence in Sonora.

Mr. Marshall replied that Arizona has a full-time representative, Ignacio Escalante, in Hermosillo, Mexico, and he has been there many years, so there is someone with the state's interest located on the border. Mr. Marshall stated that states have offices in Mexico that are specifically targeted to the supply chains of certain industries, which might not be Mexico City. He said that there is nothing to preclude them from a broader footprint that could benefit the broader membership.

Mayor Schoaf asked if the goals had already been developed or would be developed in the work plan process.

Mr. Marshall replied that this would depend on the full scope of the partnership and they want to ensure that everyone who steps up to be a partner will have a contribution. He added that there will be broad trade and tourism objectives they will be driving, along with others to reflect the interests of the partners. Mr. Marshall stated that there will be key prescribed, measured performance indicators they will embed into the request for proposals.

Mayor Schoaf moved approval of this expenditure to provide \$25,000 to the City of Phoenix to partner in the establishment of an in-market trade, investment and tourism office in Mexico City, conditioned on there being specific measurable goals that apply to MAG so at the end of the year the expenditure can be justified. Mayor Mitchell seconded.

Acting Chair LeVault asked if there was discussion of the motion.

Mayor Lord stated that she has a great relationship with Mayor Stanton and she believes in MAG, but she has concerns. She remarked that what Phoenix is doing is a great idea and is an untapped source and she looked forward to the results from the effort, but she was concerned using MAG money because it

will be extremely difficult to determine which efforts the region's money is funding and to identify the results to benefit the MAG region. Mayor Lord expressed concern with the precedent being set. What if other members decide to establish offices in other countries? How will MAG identify which are worthwhile and which are not? Mayor Lord expressed concern with MAG potentially spreading itself too thin and getting involved in efforts outside the core function of the agency. She noted that she had reviewed past material that confirmed that for her. Mayor Lord stated that all of the cities can identify with transit and transportation needs, which have not been met due to the economic shortfall. She said that she thought MAG should continue to focus on its core functions. Mayor Lord said to Mr. Smith that this was not against him – she appreciated MAG and City of Phoenix efforts – but she was concerned with using MAG money for this effort. Mayor Lord invited other cities to come privately to Goodyear and do a memorandum of understanding, and they will know precisely the benefits. She indicated that she would be voting against the motion.

Mayor Lane stated that he was the dissenting vote at the Executive Committee meeting yesterday, and it was not because he did not advocate for working with Mexico and he added that he has been a supporter of economic development. Mayor Lane remarked that significant amounts of funds are paid to such organizations as GPEC. Mayor Lane stated that even though he would support Mayor Lord's approach with individual cities, his greatest concern is that this is mission creep. He expressed his hope to Mayor Stanton that this would not become personal, and has nothing to do with what the City of Phoenix does with its taxpayer's money. Mayor Lane stated that it is imperative to be concerned with setting a precedent for using MAG money. He said that he thought it was a clear indication when the feds said no when asked if MPO federal transportation funds could be used for this. Mayor Lane stated that Mexico is government centric out of Mexico City, but the state of Arizona has determined to go to those centers of economic activity. He said that the state has decided to pull out of Mexico City and concentrate on efforts closer to Arizona. Mayor Lane stated that there has been activity on the part of the state, which he felt should be the level looked toward in advancing the interests of the state. Mayor Lane stated that he would be voting against the motion, and suggested to the motion maker that the MAG Regional Council, if it moves forward with this, might want to see this agreement when the scope and goals are determined and that it not be a budgeted line item but a separate item considered each year.

Mayor Schoaf, as maker of the motion, agreed to amend the motion to add that clarification. He expressed his concern for having specific measurable goals that relate to MAG and MAG's mission. Mayor Schoaf stated that MAG was originally formed as a council of governments to consider issues – a broader mission than just transportation. Mayor Schoaf expressed that he thought it critical that the goals be tied to MAG's mission and that they be measurable, that there not be an automatic reapproval, have an analysis to show the goals were met to justify the expense. He also expressed concern that we should probably be concentrating on the places of contact for businesses in Arizona, but he was willing to see if this would work over the next year.

Mayor Mitchell, as second, agreed with an amendment to the motion.

Mayor Lane asked for clarification that the amended motion included that if it passed, the expenditure would be considered each year as a separate item from the budget.

Mayor Schoaf replied yes, and he added that assuming it is passed it should not automatically be considered as a part of the budget. He said the specific goals would come back to the Regional Council and then come back in one year to see if the goals were accomplished. Mayor Schoaf stated that the concept of the motion is that there will be specific goals developed before MAG commits the money, and there will be measurable goals and an analysis at the end of the year would show if the goals, consistent with the overall mission of MAG, were accomplished. He remarked that it is an unusual expense and would not automatically be included in the budget each year.

Mayor Mitchell, as second, agreed with the amended motion. He expressed that the Economic Development Committee focuses heavily on those concepts in the motion and will be driving the direction. He felt this was a tremendous opportunity to come together as a region for economic opportunity. Mayor Mitchell stated that MAG is part of the economic vitality of the region, and is not just transportation. He spoke of the presentation the day before at the EDC meeting by Sherry Henry, Director of Tourism, that tourism is the number two industry in Arizona. He stated that there are other partners out there and this is an opportunity to market what we have to offer and get some of the trade dollars currently bypassing us. He asked for more information on other partners.

Mr. Marshall stated that many people have been approached but are waiting until more is known of the scope and details, as Mayor Lane noted. He said that the first partner was Steve Moore, but he wanted to know what they were going to do; the same with the sports teams. Mr. Marshall stated that chambers of commerce and GPEC are already partners. He noted that all of the partners will each pay the same amount with equal expectations. Mr. Marshall stated that partners expect an anticipated outcome embedded in the document so those responding to the RFP will fully understand the mission we expect them to undertake.

Mayor Lewis remarked that he thought Mayor Schoaf's comments were good policy. He indicated that this discussion revealed concerns he was not aware of before and from a policy perspective, perhaps another approach might be going to individual cities. Mayor Lewis expressed that he saw this as 25 or so municipalities contributing \$1,000 each. He remarked that the City of Phoenix does not need MAG's money to do this, so he felt it was almost an honor to be invited to participate. Mayor Lewis said that everything they have done over the past year regarding Mexico and trips we have taken, there is more to gain by being unified than by Phoenix going this alone. He noted that the City of Phoenix is taking a leadership role but has reached out to establish partnerships and he saw great strength in that. Mayor Lewis stated that his favorite video was the one that showed the result of collaboration among business and government 50 years in the future. As Mayor Schoaf said, we need to be aware of what the measurables will be and if it did not accomplish the goals after one year, it would not need to be continued. He said he felt it was an honor to be asked to have a unified approach.

Mayor Wolcott stated that she looked at this from the perspective that why would Phoenix, the sixth largest city in the country, ask MAG to participate at a \$25,000 level. Phoenix can clearly do this by itself. Mayor Wolcott stated that this is an opportunity for us to work together as a region to effect a mission she thought was very important. She noted that her concerns were mission creep and the appropriateness of spending money the feds say is not an expenditure appropriate in this manner. Mayor Wolcott stated that as long as we are working toward a measurable policy and we get a clear statement

regarding a unified mission, she thought it was a small price to pay. She indicated that she looked at this as an important gesture of good faith to all of the communities to work together and accomplish this major goal. Mayor Wolcott stated that the flat line of trade growth is very compelling, and she would like to see a similar slide for California. She added that 65 percent of freight going to California ports goes straight through Arizona with no benefit to the state. Mayor Wolcott stated that she wanted to ensure that there is some value added opportunities for Arizona from California trade.

Mayor Stanton stated that the City of Phoenix is moving forward on this effort no matter what. This office will probably look the same if they go it alone or not. Mayor Stanton stated that they will hire people for the betterment of the region, not just the City of Phoenix. He said that he was asked at Executive Committee the sign that will be on the door, and he had no preference – just what would make it successful. Mayor Stanton stated that he thought this was sending the right message that we are united as a region. He said that tourism is important, we have lost a lot of tourism over the past few years, and needs to be built back up, which is a goal among some of the sports teams because sports tourism is big business. Mayor Stanton stated that it was not really about the money, but a preferable way to reach out to all of the communities. He said that the office will still assist those in the region. Mayor Stanton noted that Speaker Tobin said that the state is looking at it and it would be great if the state became their partner. Phoenix has the agility to move forward quickly. He commented to those who would be voting against the motion, he was not taking it personally.

Councilmember Farrar stated that Sonora is the second largest state in Mexico. He indicated that he looked forward to seeing the goals that would improve relations with Puerto Penasco, Rocky Point, Cortez Airport. He said that he was familiar with delays in Mexico, at border entries, etc. Councilmember Farrar remarked that improving trade and tourism requires coordination with other organizations, such as GPEC and Homeland Security.

Mayor Kavanagh expressed her agreement with the comments made by Mayor Lord and Mayor Lane. She said that her concern is that there seems to be a great push for the agricultural industry to do more importing and trade. Mayor Kavanagh stated that she recently had a discussion with the state senator from Yuma, which is in direct competition with agriculture in Mexico. She stated that even though Yuma is not at this table MAG needs to be concerned for its agricultural industry and in the rest of the country. Mayor Kavanagh stated that Yuma's unemployment rate is currently 24 percent and it is heavily dependent on its agriculture. She said that she would not want to do anything to the detriment of Arizona agriculture and she would like to see the scope in relation to agriculture to make sure there are safeguards to Arizona's own industries.

Mr. Smith explained that if this item receives a positive vote, MAG staff Alana Chavez would send out an email to Regional Council, Management Committee and Intergovernmental Representatives requesting input. He noted that this would have to be scaled with the amount of money being put in: \$25,000 out of \$200,000+. Mr. Smith stated that MAG will work with Mr. Marshall, get the scope, and send it out for a quick turnaround because it goes out in December. He said that this does not mean we will get everything we ask for, but at least we have input. Mr. Smith stated that one of the major elements will be setting up meetings with those cities who want to go there. He said that MAG is

interested in business development with the BIEN project and with infrastructure improvements that would have complementary infrastructure improvements on the Mexico side.

Mayor Tibshraeny asked for clarification if the RFP process was to develop the scope of goals and how the office will operate.

Mr. Marshall replied that the RFP will be very specific – it will include a specific ask so any qualified service provider can respond. He said that they will be asking that the resource be based there, an in-market, dedicated resource so they are not traveling every week to make things happen. Mr. Marshall stated that some will do Tennessee on Tuesday, Pittsburgh on Thursday, and New York on Friday, but they want a dedicated source. Mr. Marshall stated that the RFP will outline the duties the resource will be required to perform and the time schedule. He said that have asked the resource at the six-month point, to perform a look forward on what they think the second year's activities will look like if the contract was renewed. Mr. Marshall stated that the RFP will go out asking people to respond if they can perform the following and get this done.

Mayor Tibshraeny asked if approved, the first part would be to help develop the RFP for the service provider.

Mr. Marshall replied yes, the \$25,000 from MAG would be one of 10, 15 or 20 partners and to keep in mind keeping expectations reasonable. He said if the amount was \$250,000 or thereabouts, the expectations would be commensurate with that.

Mayor Tibshraeny asked if GPEC was involved in this. Mr. Marshall replied yes.

Acting Chair LeVault asked those on teleconference if they had comments.

Mayor Rogers stated that MAG certainly needs a presence in Mexico, specifically Mexico City. She said that she wanted to commend the mayors for filling the voids in economic development and Phoenix is trying to do that through a creative thought process. Mayor Rogers expressed appreciation for the motion; for \$25,000 you would not be able to do a study, fix a road, or buy a bus. She said that MAG can pull out at the end of the year if it does not work out. Mayor Rogers remarked that \$25,000 is an amount that could be expended without creating too much of a problem. She said that this entity is crucial to us and we need to have that presence.

Vice Mayor Finter stated that the City of Mesa is excited about the effort. He said that international outreach is important to them and they appreciate having a check and balance and re-evaluation process after one year.

Mayor Lane stated that scopes by nature are broad-based. He said that from a Phoenix perspective there would be a scope of activities they anticipate will be performed by this consultant. Mayor Lane stated he would be very interested in seeing how the scope is developed.

Acting Chair LeVault stated that after the Executive Committee meeting yesterday, he re-read the MAG By-Laws and the Articles of Incorporation. He said that the Articles give MAG broad latitude in defining its message. Acting Chair LeVault read from the Articles: To facilitate agreements among the governmental units for specific projects or other interrelated developmental actions or for the adoption of common policies with respect to problems which are common to its members. To attain the greatest degree of intergovernmental cooperation possible in order to prepare for future growth and development of the region.

Acting Chair LeVault stated that he has been on the Regional Council for five or six years and he has seen the MAG mission evolve in response to the changing environment. He said that he thought the member agencies do a good job cooperating and acting in the best interest of the region. Acting Chair LeVault stated that 2.5 years ago, the Economic Development Committee chose to travel down this road toward enhanced trade with Mexico. He remarked that from his perspective, this is the next logical step to continue down that road. Acting Chair LeVault stated that he was pursuing the same thing as everyone else at the table – a solid, vibrant Arizona economy with many dimensions – so the region does not endure what it did a couple of years ago. Acting Chair LeVault stated that he felt that enhanced trade with Mexico is one piece of the puzzle we are trying to put together.

Acting Chair LeVault recognized public comment from Ms. Dianne Barker, who expressed her support for Mr. Marshall's work and she was very happy with Mayor Stanton's efforts to bring in businesses. Ms. Barker thanked Mayor Lord for expressing concerns. She stated that if this had been presented at the technical committee level first, many of the measures would have been ironed out. Ms. Barker stated that she has seen some approvals that are rubber stamped, but she applauded the Regional Council for discussing this. Ms. Barker noted that Texas has five highways on the border and Arizona has one. She remarked that Arizona has been in a malaise for a long time not doing what we need to do in regard to Mexico and it is helpful to look at models in Texas and San Diego and see what they have done right. Ms. Barker suggested seeing if Apple, which has changed supply chain management, would want to donate. Acting Chair LeVault thanked Ms. Barker for her comments.

Acting Chair LeVault recognized public comment from Dr. Marvin Rochelle, who expressed his agreement with Mayor Stanton's comments to the fullest degree. Dr. Rochelle urged getting Interstate 11 finished to bring in more revenue. Acting Chair LeVault thanked Dr. Rochelle for his comments.

With no further discussion, the vote on the motion passed, with Mayor Georgia Lord, Mayor Jim Lane, and Mayor Linda Kavanagh voting no, and Mayor Greg Stanton abstaining.

7. Winter Holiday No Burn Campaign

Corky Martinkovic from the Maricopa County Air Quality Department provided a report on the Winter Holiday No Burn Campaign. Ms. Martinkovic stated that the campaign is designed to reduce concentrations of PM-2.5. She explained that pollution is caused when cold air meets inversion and smoke from fireplaces, which traps smoke. Ms. Martinkovic explained that the time period between late November and early January is when people are burning wood during the holiday season.

Ms. Martinkovic stated that the Environmental Protection Agency changed the standard for PM-2.5 from 15 parts per micrograms per cubic meter to 12 parts per microgram per cubic meter, which could put this region in a situation where we could go into nonattainment for that pollutant.

Ms. Martinkovic stated that the Winter Holiday No Burn Campaign was developed by the County and the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality to inform the public when wood burning during cold air inversions could result in pollution. Ms. Martinkovic stated that they request that people not burn wood on high pollution advisory days or no burn days. She stressed that they are not requesting no wood burning every day, it is just for certain days when the PM-2.5 levels are high. Ms. Martinkovic displayed a graph of the monitors showing spikes in PM-2.5 on certain days. Ms. Martinkovic stated that the County analyzes the air and pointed out a graph that showed smoke was the predominant element in analysis conducted by the County.

Bob Huhn from the Maricopa County Air Quality Department continued the presentation. He said that the County is gratified by the contributions of stakeholders and partners, such as the Grocery Association, the Restaurant Association, health and wellness communities, the Arizona Department of Transportation, MAG, and cities and towns. Mr. Huhn stated that PM-2.5 is a countywide concern because the region wants to stay out of nonattainment. He said that the campaign's message is "No Burn Day? Don't Burn Wood!" Mr. Huhn emphasized that no wood burning is just for certain days when PM-2.5 levels are high, not for every day.

Mr. Huhn mentioned that the message will appear on Arizona Department of Transportation freeway signs, signs posted by the Grocers Association and Bashas' grocery stores where logs are sold, and on billboards donated by Lamar Advertising. Mr. Huhn stated that the message will also be communicated in Spanish. Mr. Huhn stated that another message was developed by the stakeholders, "Don't Let Our Air Go Up in Smoke," that will be incorporated into the campaign.

Mr. Huhn stated that the campaign has developed radio and television public service announcements (PSAs). He noted that most of the stations in the Valley have donated air time for the PSAs, but the campaign is also looking at buying some time. Mr. Huhn stated that the campaign will be kicked off at a news conference on November 25, 2013.

Mr. Huhn described one of the PSAs, which includes NBA Hall of Fame basketball player Ralph Sampson, who donated his time. In addition, Valley Metro has given permission to run a very popular PSA from years ago that featured a coughing camel.

Mr. Huhn stated that the cities have offered billboard space, time on their municipal cable channels, public affairs shows, websites, water bill inserts, and social media.

Acting Chair LeVault thanked Ms. Martinkovic and Mr. Huhn for their reports and asked members if they had questions.

Mayor Schoaf asked for clarification if the PM- 2.5 standard was an annual standard. Ms. Martinkovic replied yes, and that it is a complex standard the way it is measured. There are running averages over

a three year period, so there is a 24 hour measure, an annual measure, and that is measured over a three year average. Ms. Martinkovic stated that it becomes a concern because EPA will be looking at the numbers in the early part of next year. If we go over the standard then we could be going into possible nonattainment.

Mayor Schoaf asked how close to nonattainment we are. Ms. Martinkovic replied that we got very close this past weekend to the 24-hour number, which is 35. She indicated that she thought if we were to have some events this year we would be close to violation.

Mayor Kavanagh asked if there was scientific proof that the principal cause of the PM-2.5 pollution was wood burning. Ms. Martinkovic replied that the County will be doing speciation studies, but they do have studies done in the past that showed wood burning is a major component. She added that some parts of Arizona are dealing with PM-2.5 as a pollutant. Ms. Martinkovic stated that wood burning stoves were problems in Nogales. Payson did a lot of fireplace replacements to deal with its problem. Mayor Kavanagh stated that it is easier to tell people not to burn wood than to not use their cars.

Mayor Kavanagh asked for clarification of billboards saying this is a “No Burn Day.” Mr. Huhn stated that there are two different billboards and messages. The message, “Today is a No Burn Day,” will appear on electronic billboards so they can change daily. These are in addition to the traditional billboards that say, “No Burn Day? Don’t Burn Wood!”

8. 2013 Annual Report on the Status of the Implementation of Proposition 400

Proposition 400 was approved by the voters of Maricopa County in November 2004, and authorized the extension of a half-cent sales tax for use on transportation projects in the MAG Regional Transportation Plan. A.R.S. 28-6354 requires that MAG issue an annual report on projects included in Proposition 400, addressing factors such as project status, funding, and priorities. The 2013 Annual Report is the ninth report in the series and covers the status of the life cycle programs for freeways/highways, arterial streets, and public transit. A Summary of Findings and Issues is included in the attached material and the full report is available on the MAG website.

Due to the length of the meeting, no verbal report was given. No questions from the Regional Council were noted.

9. Draft Primary Freight Network

Tim Strow, MAG staff, reported that on November 19, 2013, the United States Department of Transportation (USDOT) released the official designation of the Primary Freight Network as required in MAP-21 Legislation. He said that the USDOT’s goal is to identify a strategic plan in regard to future investments in the roadway system. Mr. Strow stated that they looked at a multitude of data platforms to identify where the freight was moving.

Mr. Strow displayed a map of the Primary Freight Network. He noted that approximately 27,000 lane miles were identified in MAP-21 for the Primary Freight Network. Mr. Strow stated that the MPOs and

DOTs were asked to comment. He noted that in Arizona, Interstates 10, 17 and 40 were identified in the Primary Freight Network, but there are gaps, for example, parts of Interstate 17 are Primary Network and parts are Secondary Network.

Mr. Strow stated that comments were solicited, for such items as whether the Network should be expanded or should there be funding attached. He said that MAG staff is working with ADOT and the other MPOs in the state to coordinate comments. Mr. Strow stated that some of the comments will include that Interstate 17 should be entirely a Primary Freight Network, include Interstate 8, which is a major connector of ports of entry, and SR-85. He noted that comments are due December 19, 2013, and a final recommendation is expected next summer. Mr. Strow mentioned the importance of commenting due to the possibility of funding for freight in the next surface transportation bill.

Acting Chair LeVault thanked Mr. Strow for his report. No questions from the Council were noted.

10. “Think Before You Shop” MAG Videos - Encouraging Residents to Reduce, Reuse, and Recycle During the Holidays

Christine Smith, City of Phoenix, and Chair of the Solid Waste Advisory Committee, reported on efforts to reduce, reuse, and recycle this holiday season. She noted that the MAG Solid Waste Advisory Committee recently produced a series of 30-second videos that encourage residents to “Think Before You Shop” and provide tips on how to reduce, reuse and recycle during the holidays.

Ms. Smith stated that solid waste is a major issue. During the holidays, 25 percent more trash is generated than during any other period throughout the year. She noted that the committee is reaching out to the community in ways that address all jurisdictions’ recycling programs. It was noted that the videos were developed for use on municipal cable channels and as media clips.

Ms. Smith then played the six videos that discuss disposable dinnerware, gift wrap, greeting cards, foam packing, cardboard, and plastic bags. Ms. Smith expressed her appreciation to MAG staff, Kelly Taft and Julie Hoffman, who worked on the project. Ms. Smith also expressed appreciation to the City of Chandler for the use of their studio in the production of the videos.

Acting Chair LeVault thanked Ms. Smith for her report and asked if there were questions.

Mayor Kavanagh asked how the videos could be obtained for broadcast on their municipal channel. Ms. Smith replied that all members of the Solid Waste Advisory Committee received copies of the videos, and copies will also be provided to jurisdictions that do not have a representative on the committee.

11. Legislative Update

No report was required.

12. Request for Future Agenda Items

Topics or issues of interest that the Regional Council would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting were requested.

No requests were noted.

13. Comments from the Council

An opportunity was provided for Regional Council members to present a brief summary of current events. The Regional Council is not allowed to propose, discuss, deliberate or take action at the meeting on any matter in the summary, unless the specific matter is properly noticed for legal action.

No comments were noted.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:15 p.m.

Chair

Secretary